

Histori Komunikasi dengan Editor Journal

Judul Artikel: Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia

Penulis: Elza Syarief (Universitas Internasional Batam, Indonesia; Email: esyarief.uib@gmail.com)

Histori Publikasi

1. 02 May 2022: [IJCC] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink (Create Account)
2. 02 May 2022; [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission
3. 06 May 2022; [IJCC] Editor Decision (Paper dikirimkan ke reviewer)
4. 10 July 2022: [IJCC] Editor Decision (Permintaan Revisi-1)
5. 18 July 2022: [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission (Revisi-1)
6. 15 September 2022: [IJCC] Editor Decision (Permintaan Revisi-2)
7. 11 October 2022: [IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission (Revisi-2)
8. 22 November 2022: [IJCC] Editor Decision (Accepted)



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] [Confirmation Required] Notification about your account creation at ManuscriptLink

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Mon, May 02, 2022, at 01:27 PM

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

This mail is to let you know that your account (Sign in ID: esyarief.uib@gmail.com) was created at the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of the International Journal of Cyber Criminology.

[NOTE] Before starting to use ManuscriptLink service, you need to confirm your email address (sign in ID) by clicking the link below:

<https://cybercrimejournal.com/manuscript/index.php/cybercrimejournal/login>

Through the following link, you can access the online manuscript submission and peer-review system of *International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc?id=esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

In the ManuscriptLink online system,

- * If you are an author of manuscript, you can submit a manuscript and keep a close watch over the on-going review process including the review history of past manuscripts.
- * If you are a manager of a journal, you can create and manage a new journal submission and review service, and customize your service according to the demand of editorial members.
- * If you are an editorial member of a journal, you can manage a review process for a submitted manuscript and enhance the academic value of the journal by accepting or rejecting publication of submitted manuscripts.
- * If you are a reviewer of a journal, you can evaluate a submitted manuscript and send your review report to editorial members of the journal.

Best regards,

ManuscriptLink Support Team
Email: support@manuscriptlink.com
<https://www.manuscriptlink.com>

Terms of Service and Privacy Policy
Terms of Service : <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/termsOfService>
Privacy Policy: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/docs/privacyPolicy>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Mon, May 02, 2022, at 01:39 PM

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to *the International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track
Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia
Author(s): Elza Syarief
Corresponding Author: Elza Syarief
Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Internasional Batam, Indonesia
Date of Manuscript Submission: 02-May-2022 (UTC)
The manuscript ID: IJCC-25-2022

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Cyber Criminology
Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Fri, May 06, 2022, at 10:16 AM

To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to *the International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track

Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia

Author(s): Elza Syarief

Corresponding Author: Elza Syarief

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Internasional Batam, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 02-May-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCC-25-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Cyber Criminology

Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Sun, Jul 10, 2022, at 10:11 AM

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the International Journal of Cyber Criminology., "Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia."

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Cyber Criminology
Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail

Reviewer- A

Decision: Major revisions required

This manuscript presents an important topic of the security concerns associated with electronic land certificates due to cyber-attacks in light of legislation and regulations that protect landowners from such risks. The authors put considerable effort into providing a comprehensive overview of the history and significance of electronic land certificates, data encryption, the growth of land laws, their availability, and the significance of cybersecurity to electronic land certificates in Indonesia. To fulfil the study's goal, a qualitative research design aided by a documentation technique for data collecting from diverse resources, such as case studies, legal archives, library facilities, and informal interviews with land officials from numerous locations in Indonesia, was employed. It was concluded that despite several laws and regulations about the protection of land rights and electronic land certificates in Indonesia, several restrictions exist regarding the availability of regulations against false documentation and several escape routes for hackers and cybercriminals. In addition to the laws and regulations in Indonesia, their execution must be expedited, and the judicial system must be strengthened to maximize the benefits of such laws and regulations. Here are a few more suggestions for the author/authors

- i. The introduction part is very well written, with the latest articulation of the existing literature and presentation of the gap. However, the authors should also add the research objectives at the end of the introduction section to clarify their intentions. Prior research revealed electronic land certificates' significance in accessibility, dependability, and legal standing. The authors should explain what is new in the current study, followed by this paragraph.
 - ii. The research methodology is well written, where the authors employed a qualitative research approach aided by a documentation technique to collect data from various sources, including case studies, legal archives, library facilities, and informal interviews with land officials in diverse regions of Indonesia. It covers all the important information linked with the study topic.
 - iii. The author should present separate headings for the results and discussions, starting from the explanation of the digital law certification followed by the Data Encryption, Types, and Working.
 - iv. Highlight the limitations in the existing system along with future recommendations to change the system for the benefit of the masses.
 - v. The author should also mention and explain Articles 263, 264, and 266 of the Criminal Code (Book of Criminal Law)
 - vi. The implications are merged with the limitations and future recommendations section. However, all these three types should be separately presented to benefit the readers linked with the laws and regulations available for digital property protection in Indonesia
 - vii. There must be a separate conclusion section at the end of the manuscript to present all the facts and figures in consolidated form.
 - viii. There are several grammatical mistakes, especially in terms of Presenting articles like “a” and “the”, which must be overcome by the authors before submitting the final version of their manuscript.
-

Reviewer -B

Decision: Major revisions required

The article presents the consolidated information reflecting a significant difference between traditional record keeping regarding land and its digital transformation in a technological era. The article also presents the laws and regulations available in Indonesia to protect digital property/assets. Regardless of a well-written paper, I have some concerns regarding the presentation of the material and explanation as follows;

1. The author should start the introduction by explaining the digital intrusion into human life and its importance in digital property protection in light of laws and regulations. Also, add: Indonesia is one of the largest Asian nations with rapid digital penetration in nearly all spheres of life, including education, business, religious matters, the health sector, government matters reliant on e-governance, and the digitalization of manual documents about real estate, among others. It is better to present the research objectives in bullet form at the end of the introduction for more clarity.

2. What are the cybersecurity laws in Indonesia? Start with explaining and presenting the Regulation of the National Land Agency (BPN) No. 1 of 202.
3. Authors should also mention and explain the working of the Ministry of Electronic Information Law (MEIL) and the Ministry of Communication and Informatics (MOCI),
4. You have well presented the existing laws and regulations linked with digital property protection. However, what role government may play in implementing the existing laws and spreading awareness among the citizens is not clear.
5. In addition to discussing the history of electronic land certification and the encryption of vital documents, this study should also establish the legal status of such certifications in Indonesia.
6. Authors must add a conclusion while presenting future research directions for scholars and practitioners.
7. There is also a need to proof-edit the whole manuscript along with checking the citations.



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>

Mon, Jul 18, 2022, at 02:10 PM

To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to *the International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track

Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia

Author(s): Elza Syarief

Corresponding Author: Elza Syarief

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Internasional Batam, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 02-May-2022 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCC-25-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Cyber Criminology

Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-A

No	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>This manuscript presents an important topic of the security concerns associated with electronic land certificates due to cyber-attacks in light of legislation and regulations that protect landowners from such risks. The authors put considerable effort into providing a comprehensive overview of the history and significance of electronic land certificates, data encryption, the growth of land laws, their availability, and the significance of cybersecurity to electronic land certificates in Indonesia. To fulfil the study's goal, a qualitative research design aided by a documentation technique for data collecting from diverse resources, such as case studies, legal archives, library facilities, and informal interviews with land officials from numerous locations in Indonesia, was employed. It was concluded that despite several laws and regulations about the protection of land rights and electronic land certificates in Indonesia, several restrictions exist regarding the availability of regulations against false documentation and several escape routes for hackers and cybercriminals. In addition to the laws and regulations in Indonesia, their execution must be expedited, and the judicial system must be strengthened to maximize the benefits of such laws and regulations. Here are a few more suggestions for the author/authors</p>	<p>Thanks very much, dear reviewer, for your kind consideration, remarks, and suggestions.</p>
1	<p>The introduction part is very well written, with the latest articulation of the existing literature and presentation of the gap. However, the authors should also add the</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind comments.</p>

	<p>research objectives at the end of the introduction section to clarify their intentions. Prior research revealed electronic land certificates' significance in accessibility, dependability, and legal standing. The authors should explain what is new in the current study, followed by this paragraph.</p>	<p>I have added the research objectives at the end of the introduction section as per your kind suggestion. Also explained the newness of the current study.</p> <p>Please see pages 2-5</p>
2.	<p>The research methodology is well written, where the authors employed a qualitative research approach aided by a documentation technique to collect data from various sources, including case studies, legal archives, library facilities, and informal interviews with land officials in diverse regions of Indonesia. It covers all the important information linked with the study topic.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Many thanks for your kind comments.</p>
3.	<p>The author should present separate headings for the results and discussions, starting from the explanation of the digital law certification followed by the Data Encryption, Types, and Working.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, I have now separately discussed the digital law certification followed by the Data Encryption, Types, and Working as per your kind suggestion</p> <p>Please see pages 8-13</p>
4.	<p>Highlight the limitations in the existing system along with future recommendations to change the system for the benefit of the masses.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, done as suggested.</p> <p>Please see page 15</p>
5.	<p>The author should also mention and explain Articles 263, 264, and 266 of the Criminal Code (Book of Criminal Law)</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines, done as suggested.</p> <p>Please see page 16</p>
6.	<p>The implications are merged with the limitations and future recommendations section. However, all these three types should be separately presented to benefit the readers linked with the laws and regulations available for digital property protection in Indonesia</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind suggestion.</p> <p>I have now separated the implications from the limitations and future recommendations section</p> <p>Please see pages 16-18.</p>

7	There must be a separate conclusion section at the end of the manuscript to present all the facts and figures in consolidated form.	Done, dear reviewer. Please see pages 19-20
8	There are several grammatical mistakes, especially in terms of Presenting articles like "a" and "the" which must be overcome by the authors before submitting the final version of their manuscript.	Done, dear reviewer, as suggested.

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER-B

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	This article aimed to explore the scope and aims of Indonesia's competition strategy in light of the country's expanding trade and investment regime. The study evaluated the Indonesian competition laws and regulations in the context of a normative competition law theory framework and the execution of competition law provisions. Also, the Cases assessed by the Business Competition Supervisory Commission (KPPU) were also mentioned as evidence of alleged competition law violations. The study employed a documentation survey and exploratory research methodology to determine the applicable national and international business competition laws and the underlying regulations companies must adhere to in terms of labour and wages, competition, trade tariffs, health and safety, the environment, and data protection. The research will have a positive social influence on the working relationships between SMEs and their stakeholders. Additionally, this article discusses and analyzes competition laws in effect in Indonesia to safeguard consumer and societal	Thanks a lot, dear reviewer. I am very grateful for all the valid and valuable comments in improving the paper's quality.

	interests and shows a considerable effort of the author/authors while writing. However, there are a few comments regarding each part of the manuscript, which may be helpful to the authors in improving it.	
1.	The author should start the introduction by explaining the digital intrusion into human life and its importance in digital property protection in light of laws and regulations. Also, add: Indonesia is one of the largest Asian nations with rapid digital penetration in nearly all spheres of life, including education, business, religious matters, the health sector, government matters reliant on e-governance, and the digitalization of manual documents about real estate, among others. It is better to present the research objectives in bullet form at the end of the introduction for more clarity.	Dear reviewer, I have revised the introduction by explaining the digital intrusion into human life and its importance in digital property protection in light of laws and regulations. Also added: Indonesia is one of the largest Asian nations with rapid digital penetration in nearly all spheres of life, including education, business, religious matters, the health sector, government matters reliant on e-governance, and the digitalization of manual documents about real estate, among others. I have also added research objectives in bullet form at the end of the introduction as per your kind suggestion. Please see pages 2-5
2.	What are the cybersecurity laws in Indonesia? Start with explaining and presenting the Regulation of the National Land Agency (BPN) No. 1 of 202.	Done, Dear reviewer, as per kind suggestion. Please see page 12
3.	Authors should also mention and explain the working of the Ministry of Electronic Information Law (MEIL) and the Ministry of Communication and Informatics (MOCI),	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see page 14
4	You have well presented the existing laws and regulations linked with digital property protection. However, what role government may play in implementing the existing laws and spreading awareness among the citizens is not clear.	Dear reviewer, many thanks. Following your kind guidelines, I have elaborated on the role government may play in implementing the existing laws and spreading awareness among the citizens. Please see pages 15-16

5	In addition to discussing the history of electronic land certification and the encryption of vital documents, this study should also establish the legal status of such certifications in Indonesia.	Dear reviewer, many thanks for your kind guidelines. I have now discussed in detail the history of electronic land certification and encryption. Please see pages 15-18
6	Authors must add a conclusion while presenting future research directions for scholars and practitioners.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 19
7	There is also a need to proof-edit the whole manuscript along with checking the citations.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Thur, Sep 15, 2022, at 08:29 AM

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to *the International Journal of Cyber Criminology*, "Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia."

Our decision is: Revisions Required

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month.

Let me know if you have any questions.

Best

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Cyber Criminology
Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>



IJCC-25-2022_review.docx
37Kb

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Tue, Oct 11, 2022, at 09:32 AM

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to *the International Journal of Cyber Criminology*.

Track: Regular Track
Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in
Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia
Author(s): Elza Syarief
Corresponding Author: Elza Syarief
Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Internasional Batam, Indonesia
Date of Manuscript Submission: 02-May-2022 (UTC)
The manuscript ID: IJCC-25-2022

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcc>

If you have any question regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Cyber Criminology
Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.

RESPONSE TO REVIEWER

No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	Reviewers raised a few important concerns and recommended minor revisions.	Thank you, dear reviewer, for your kind consideration.
1.	To what extent computerized land certificates based on dependability and modernism are gaining favour in Indonesian law?	Dear reviewer followed your kind instructions and reported the extent computerized land certificates based on dependability and modernism are gaining favour in Indonesian law. Please see page 3
2	Why there exist an urgent need to adopt laws and regulations to safeguard these landowners in Indonesia?	Dear reviewer followed your kind instructions and explained the urgent need to adopt laws and regulations to safeguard these landowners in Indonesia Please see page 4
3	How did the Evolution of the land laws in Indonesia happen over the years?	Dear reviewer evolution of the land laws in Indonesia that happened over the years has been reported now. Please see page 15
	What is the role of the Indonesian Police Department in combating cyber security violations?	The Indonesian Police Department in combating cyber security violations has been explained as suggested. Please see page 17



Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

[IJCC] Editor Decision

1 message

IJCC <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: M Elza Syarief <esyarief.uib@gmail.com>

Tue, Nov 22, 2022, at 10:51 AM

Dear Dr. Elza Syarief,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track
Security Concerns in Digital Transformation of Electronic Land Registration: Legal Protection in
Cybersecurity Laws in Indonesia
Author(s): Elza Syarief
Corresponding Author: Elza Syarief
Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Internasional Batam, Indonesia
Date of Manuscript Submission: 02-May-2022 (UTC)
The manuscript ID: IJCC-25-2022

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Cyber Criminology* (Vol. 16 No. 2, 2022).
Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google
Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Cyber Criminology
Homepage: <https://www.ijcc.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.